My Copy
Sent this Date
(SEE OVER)

(1)

August 24, 2020,

The Honourable Patty Hajdu, Lib, M.P.
Minister of Health for Canada,

Dear Ms. Hajdu.

As one of your constituents, and a supporter, I ask you to give consideration to the following matter of concern.

In an effort to be as brief as possible without sacrificing clarity, I have included a previous corres.to your colleague Mr. Gravelle and his response, it will provide additional details of the matter. I have also included some other supporting doc. which you may wish to view.

I ask for your assistance in obtaining a response from one Director Shelly Emmerson of Access to Information and Privacy at the Ministry of Environment and Climate Change, concerning a time extension. Specifically, I view her arbitrary levy of an additional one hundred and twenty (120) days over and above the initial thirty (30) day allotment, or a total of five (5) months to complete my (FOI) request, excessive. I consider the time extension unwarranted based upon the resources available to her within that Ministry. Over and above the initial 30 day period available to the ministry, I have proposed an extension of another thirty (30) days, but to this reasonable compromise I can get no response. It would seem Director Emmerson has decided to disregard any offer from my end, and delay my access to information within their files for an additional four months. I enclose a copy of both the Ministries letter dated July 6th, and my response to the same for your viewing.

Any reasonable time extension would be acceptable to me, but I expect a response from Director Emmerson as necessary in order to establish the same.

It is my contention that the Ministry of the Environment and Climate Change has pertinent documentation concerning this "hushed up CN Rail environmental disaster". In particular, information required to determine health risks associated with long term exposure to this pollution, which should be made available to the people of Hornepayne.

Concerning this matter, I am presently forwarding as much information obtainable as possible, to the Canadian Environmental Law Society (CELA) who is doing an assessment of the entire matter. Through CELA and litigation it is my hope that liability will be established for the extensive damage done from CN's pollution in that community, and ultimately the ten point six million dollars that the people of Hornepayne were swindled out of be recovered and returned to them.

A heartfelt thank you for any time, consideration, and or action you give to this matter on our behalf, and should your require more info. please do not hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,
George Collins

Nipigon Ont.
Box 833, P0T 2J0

(1)

August 24, 2020,

The Honourable Patty Hajdu, Lib, M.P.
Minister of Health for Canada,

Dear Ms. Hajdu.

As one of your constituents, and a supporter, I ask you to give consideration to the following matter of concern.

In an effort to be as brief as possible without sacrificing clarity, I have included a previous corres.to your colleague Mr. Gravelle and his response, it will provide additional details of the matter. I have also included some other supporting doc. which you may wish to view.

I ask for your assistance in obtaining a response from one Director Shelly Emmerson of Access to Information and Privacy at the Ministry of Environment and Climate Change, concerning a time extension. Specifically, I view her arbitrary levy of an additional one hundred and twenty (120) days over and above the initial thirty (30) day allotment, or a total of five (5) months to complete my (FOI) request, excessive. I consider the time extension unwarranted based upon the resources available to her within that Ministry. Over and above the initial 30 day period available to the ministry, I have proposed an extension of another thirty (30) days, but to this reasonable compromise I can get no response. It would seem Director Emmerson has decided to disregard any offer from my end, and delay my access to information within their files for an additional four months. I enclose a copy of both the Ministries letter dated July 6th, and my response to the same for your viewing.

Any reasonable time extension would be acceptable to me, but I expect a response from Director Emmerson as necessary in order to establish the same.

It is my contention that the Ministry of the Environment and Climate Change has pertinent documentation concerning this "hushed up CN Rail environmental disaster". In particular, information required to determine health risks associated with long term exposure to this pollution, which should be made available to the people of Hornepayne.

Concerning this matter, I am presently forwarding as much information obtainable as possible, to the Canadian Environmental Law Society (CELA) who is doing an assessment of the entire matter. Through CELA and litigation it is my hope that liability will be established for the extensive damage done from CN's pollution in that community, and ultimately the ten point six million dollars that the people of Hornepayne were swindled out of be recovered and returned to them.

A heartfelt thank you for any time, consideration, and or action you give to this matter on our behalf, and should your require more info. please do not hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,
George Collins

Nipigon Ont.
Box 833, P0T 2J0

Ottawa
Room 278, Confederation Building
Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0A6
Tel.: 613-996-4792
Fax.: 613-996-9785

Ottawa
Pièce 278, Édifice de la Confédération
Ottawa (Ontario) K1A 0A6
Tél. : 613-996-4792
Téléc. : 613-996-9785

HOUSE OF COMMONS
CHAMBRE DES COMMUNES
CANADA

Hon. Patty Hajdu, P.C., M.P.

Member of Parliament / Députée
Thunder Bay—Superior North / Thunder Bay—Supérieur-Nord

Constituency
705 Red River Road Suite 3
Thunder Bay, Ontario P7B 1J3
Tel.: 807-766-2090
Fax.: 807-766-2094

Circonscription
705, route Red River bureau 3
Thunder Bay (Ontario) P7B 1J3
Tél. : 807-766-2090
Téléc. : 807-766-2094

October 12, 2020

George Collins
Box 833
Nipigon, ON P0T 2J0

COPY

Dear George,

Thank you for including me in your correspondence and for sharing the details of your request for information to the Ministry of Environment and Climate Change. I can appreciate the incredible amount of work you have put into resolving the ground-water contamination issue near Hornepayne.

After reading your documents, I have forwarded the concerns to Honourable Jonathan Wilkinson, Minister for Environment and Climate Change and asked that his office include me in any further correspondence regarding this matter.

I understand your frustration with the timelines provided by Ms. Shelly Emmerson. As she outlines in her correspondence, however, it is due to the complexity of your request and the significant amount of records involved that the timeline extension is required. I note though that your suggestion of a shortened extension has gone unanswered.

In addition, it is important to note that all government departments continue to work to ensure the safety of all Canadians and that due to the COVID-19 pandemic there may be further delays beyond typical wait times. As departments make a safe transition back to their offices, we ask that Canadians be patient during these unprecedented times.

I have attached a copy of my correspondence to Minister Wilkinson for your review.

Sincerely,

P Hajdu

Honourable Patty Hajdu
Member of Parliament
Thunder Bay—Superior North

Encl.

Patty.Hajdu@parl.gc.ca

Ottawa
Room 278, Confederation Building
Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0A6
Tel.: 613-996-4792
Fax.: 613-996-9785

Ottawa
Pièce 278, Édifice de la Confédération
Ottawa (Ontario) K1A 0A6
Tél. : 613-996-4792
Téléc. : 613-996-9785

HOUSE OF COMMONS
CHAMBRE DES COMMUNES
CANADA

Hon. Patty Hajdu, P.C., M.P.

Member of Parliament / Députée
Thunder Bay—Superior North / Thunder Bay—Supérieur-Nord

Constituency
705 Red River Road Suite 3
Thunder Bay, Ontario P7B 1J3
Tel.: 807-766-2090
Fax.: 807-766-2094

Circonscription
705, route Red River bureau 3
Thunder Bay (Ontario) P7B 1J3
Tél. : 807-766-2090
Téléc. : 807-766-2094

October 12, 2020

Honourable Jonathan Wilkinson
Minister of Environment and Climate Change
Environment and Climate Change Canada
200 Sacré-Coeur Boulevard
Gatineau QC K1A 0H3

COPY

Dear Minister Wilkinson,

Please see attached correspondence from my constituent, Mr. Collins' , regarding his request for information related to concerns of an unresolved ground-water contamination issue near Hornepayne, Ontario.

Mr. Collins' is growing further concerned and frustrated with a recent notice for a 120 day extension on his request for information from Environment and Climate Change Canada. His request to consider a shorter extension of 30 days has gone unanswered. Mr. Collins has been advocating for a resolution to this issue for a number of years and feels the information requested is critical in moving forward.

Please note that I have advised Mr. Collins' of the complexity of his enquiry and the significance of the searches required to answer his questions.

In order to better serve my constituent, I kindly request that your office includes me in any further correspondence regarding this matter.

Sincerely,

Honourable Patty Hajdu
Member of Parliament
Thunder Bay—Superior North

Encl.

cc: George Collins
Box 833
Nipigon, ON P0T 2J0

Patty.Hajdu@parl.gc.ca

Sent Nov 2nd-2020

(1)

November 2nd,2020,
The Honourable Patty Hajdu P.C. M.D.

Minister of Health for Canada,
MP Thunder Bay – Superior North.

Dear Patty,

As indicated in your letter of Oct 12th, I thank you for your concern and for contacting the Hon. Jonathon Wilkinson, Minister of the MOECC with regard to the ground water contamination in Hornepayne.

Minister, realizing you and your Ministry are facing a worldwide pandemic the stresses and complexity of which are colossal. I offer the following encouragement, as indicated by the record your comprehensive handling of the matter places Canada in an enviable position when compared with our neighbours to the south.

Under the present circumstances I hesitate to make any further request of your time, but considering the potential health risks to the people in Hornepayne who have been living on or near CN's contamination for decades, my concern for their welfare requires me to request the following. In your capacity as Minister of Health would you direct your ministry to make a determination based upon the facts, concerning any potential health risk associated with the above mentioned contamination, and make the findings public for their guidance and welfare?

On behalf of those people who include, relatives, friends, and past neighbours, I have tried to ascertain the same for years but to no avail. I include the most recent attempt as an example of the difficulty a member of the public may encounter when trying to obtain an opinion which might not be favourable to Corporate Canada.

On the 30th of July last, I contacted Agat Laboratories in Calgary requesting a professional opinion with regard to any health concerns based on the same five pages which were attached to your Aug 24th corres., which were taken from The Final Report for CN's Hornepayne Rail Yard 2015. My initial email request to Agat resulted in a return phone call within hours from one Becky Jenner, Director Corporate Services. Such a prompt response was encouraging but unfortunately also misleading. After a short description of my concerns, which did not include the name of the Town or Corporation involved, she instructed me to send copies of the Analysis Report in question and they would give an opinion of the same concerning any related health risks, adding "the cost will be minimal". I immediately emailed the five documents expecting a short turn around response, and hoping the names of the parties involved would not prejudice her opinion. On or about Sept. 1st, I reached out to Agat for the results and got no reply. Consequently on Sept. 3rd I began a second inquiry, reaching out to a Dr. Charles Ramcharan of Laurentian University asking for his opinion with regard to the same five documents. On Sept 23rd I decided to try another emailed attempt to Becky Jenner to obtain her promised opinion, this time she did respond saying only "All I can tell you is that the data looks fine", her responding opinion took me by surprise . On Oct 7th Dr. Ramcharan responded with an apology for his delay and ask for more information, but he did state the following in his email "The levels of PAH's are high so you do have a contamination problem". I'm currently waiting for his conclusion based upon the additional information, and will forward the same to your office whenever I receive it, meanwhile please find attach to this letter copies of the emails referred to above, for your viewing.

The obvious discrepancy between these two opinions causes me concern; I suspect the one from Agat as being "Corporate Protective", and the one from Dr. Ramcharan as being "Causes but Objective". Considering the fact that those five documents reveal analytical results which grossly exceed MOECC parameters, some twenty years after CN's cleanup operations began, who would not be surprised at the Agat comment, "All I can tell you is the data looks fine" or be suspicious of their motives.

I feel the potential risks for those families in Hornepayne which are exposed daily to these conditions which grossly exceed established parameters are worthy of your Ministries attention. My inquiry into this matter which is based upon a sincere concern for the welfare of those families, has been exasperated by the entrenched, pro CN position of successive municipal governments since it began in 2007. In my opinion the complete lack of representation by the elected officials for the people against the documented polluter, speaks volumes and is indicative of serious "wrong doing" in this matter.

I include (2) letters of response from the CAO/Clerk of Hornepayne which clearly demonstrates the mayor and councils refusal to stand up for the community and hold CN Rail liable for their failure to implement safe guards which resulted in extensive pollution on and off their property. Upon viewing the letters I believe you will agree with me that their position and priority in this matter is not with or for the people of the community as it should be, but rather to protect Corporate CN by keeping the matter under cover up as much as possible. Initially one would suspect that the primary motive behind the lack of action by the current and previous administrations would be common FEAR of the consequences from 'the big billion dollar corporation". That motive if true would have some empathy associated with it for those people, but in my opinion the underlying motive in this matter is more sinister. To be more precise the motive behind this whole affair, is "selfish personal gain and self-promotion", at the expense of a trusting community.

Sincerely
George Collins.

#1

P.O. BOX 370
68 FRONT STREET
HORNEPAYNE, ONTARIO
P0M 1Z0

TOWNSHIP OF HORNEPAYNE

TELEPHONE 807-868-2020
FAX No. 1-807-868-2787

August 4th, 2016

George Collins
Box 883
Nipigon, ON
P0T 2J0

RE: Municipal Freedom of Information Request

Dear Mr. Collins:

The Corporation of the Township of Hornepayne ("Corporation") has received your Freedom of Information request letter ("FOI Request") dated June 25, 2016, which was sent to the Freedom of Information and Privacy Officer ("Officer") of the Corporation.

Your FOI Request seeks records within the Corporation's care and control pertaining to the "extent and degree [of] pollution and associated health risks for persons living in close proximity to CN property."

The Corporation has searched its records and does not have records in its care and control relating to this FOI Request.

Yours truly,

Gail Jaremy
CAO/Clerk
Township of Hornepayne
GEJ/

Encl.

#7

P.O. BOX 370
68 FRONT STREET
HORNEPAYNE, ONTARIO
P0M 1Z0

TOWNSHIP OF HORNEPAYNE

TELEPHONE 807-868-202
FAX No. 1-807-868-2787

May 14, 2019

George Collins
121 Fourth Street
Box 883, Nipigon, ON
P0T 2J0

Re: Requests from George Collins ("Requestor")
File Numbers: M2018-001, M2018-002, M2018-003

Dear Mr. Collins:

We are in receipt of your correspondence dated April 3, 2019, which is attached at Tab 1. This correspondence was tabled at the regular Council meeting of Wednesday, May 1, 2019. You asked Township representatives to contact other employees and members of Council at the relevant times these records were potentially/allegedly in existence.

Your letter relates to prior requests made by the you, the Requester, pursuant to the Municipal Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act ("MFIPPA"). Those relevant file numbers are M2018-001, 002 and 003 ("Prior Requests"). We have conducted the necessary investigations into these Prior Requests. We cannot provide any further records because no further records are available to us.

Your Prior Requests were responded to by the Township in accordance with MFIPPA ("Decisions"). Those relevant Decisions are attached hereto as Tabs 2, 3, and 4 respectively and had the following relevant dates:

1. M2018-001 response dated March 6, 2018;
2. M2018-002 responses dated March 26, 2018 and April 9, 2018;
3. M2018-003 responses dated April 4, 2018 and April 9, 2018;

#8

As outlined in your response letters, the recourse for further concerns or complaints about the relevant Decisions was appealing the Decisions, pursuant to Section 39 of the Act, to the Information and Privacy Commissioner of Ontario. Please note, you had 30 days from the receipt of the Township's Decisions to appeal. The Decisions set out the necessary steps that had to be taken for an appeal.

By writing this letter, the Township is not acquiescing to an extension of time to file those appeals to the Prior Requests/Decisions.

The Township will take the position that any IPC appeals of the Prior Requests/Decisions are untimely.

Sincerely,

Gail Jaremy
CAO/Clerk
Township of Hornepayne
GEJ/

c.c.: Mayor & Council

Attach:

Health Canada Response to your Correspondence

HECSB-SED-DGO / DGSESC-DSM-BDG (HC/SC) <hc.hecsb-sed-dgo-dgsesc-dsm-bdg.sc@canada.ca>

Wed 16/12/2020 04:23 PM

To: grampabug7@hotmail.com <grampabug7@hotmail.com>

Dear Mr. Collins,

I am writing in response to your letter of November 2, 2020, addressed to the Honourable Patty Hajdu, Minister of Health, concerning groundwater contamination in Hornepayne. The Minister has asked that I respond on her behalf.

I share your concern for the health and well-being of the citizens of Hornepayne, and I appreciate your efforts to acquire a factual understanding of the history and current status of the community's groundwater.

Federal government's role with respect to contaminated sites extends only to sites that are under federal custodianship. In this context, Health Canada provides guidance, training and advice on human health risk assessment to the federal organization responsible for the contaminated site. I note that the Hornepayne railyard is not identified as a site under federal jurisdiction. Information on federal contaminated sites can be found in the Federal Contaminated Sites Inventory. The determination of risks you are seeking is therefore not within the purview of Health Canada to authorize or conduct. Based on the information you have provided in your letter, you may wish to continue to follow up with your local and provincial governments.

For drinking water in Canada, responsibility is shared by the federal, provincial-territorial and municipal levels of government. Municipalities typically undertake the day-to-day operation of public drinking water systems, while the provincial and territorial governments establish regulatory drinking water requirements. Health Canada's role is to develop guidelines and screening values that indicate the levels of contaminants below which adverse health effects are not expected to occur. The Guidelines for Canadian Drinking Water Quality and screening values help jurisdictions in Canada set drinking water quality requirements for all Canadians.

I want to thank you for contacting me and for your advocacy on behalf of the residents of Hornepayne. I encourage you to continue to follow up with the contacts you have made with the municipality and the province to interpret the data that has been shared with you as they are best placed to address your concerns.

Yours sincerely,

David Morin
Director General
Safe Environments Directorate

Ministre de l'Environnement et
du Changement climatique

Minister of Environment
and Climate Change

Ottawa, Canada K1A 0H3

JAN 2 7 2021

Mr. George Collins
P.O. Box 833
Nipigon ON P0T 2J0

Dear Mr. Collins:

Your Member of Parliament, the Honourable Patty Hajdu, Minister of Health, has forwarded to me a copy of your letter of August 24, 2020, concerning your request for information related to groundwater contamination issues near Hornepayne, Ontario. I regret the delay in responding and the delay you have experienced with your Access to Information request.

Unfortunately, Environment and Climate Change Canada's ability to respond to requests within the timelines mandated by the *Access to Information Act* has been affected by the exceptional measures put in place to curb the spread of the novel coronavirus (COVID-19) and protect the health and safety of Canadians.

Environment and Climate Change Canada is currently conducting a number of consultations with other federal departments and provincial jurisdictions, as required by the Act. Environment and Climate Change Canada anticipates that the consultations will be completed by the end of March 2021. As soon as these consultations are completed, the Department's Access to Information and Privacy Division will finalize your request on a priority basis.

Thank you in advance for your patience and understanding during this period as Canadians navigate these unprecedented challenges. Rest assured that the federal government continues to make every effort to respond to your request, in accordance with operational realities.

Please accept my best regards.

Sincerely,

The Honourable Jonathan Wilkinson, P.C., M.P.

c.c.: The Honourable Patty Hajdu, P.C., M.P.

EcoLogo™ Paper / Papier Éco-Logo™

From: Michael Gravelle MPP <mgdc@shaw.ca>
Sent: July 13, 2020 10:44 AM
To: grampabug7@hotmail.com <grampabug7@hotmail.com>
Subject: Fwd: George Collins Hornepayne area water concerns

From: "mgdc" <mgdc@shaw.ca>
To: info@environmentaldefence.ca, comments@auditor.on.ca, "minister mecp" <minister.mecp@ontario.ca>
Cc: rampabug7@hotmail.com, "Larry Joy" <ljoy@liberal.ola.org>, "Gravelle_Michael-MPP-CO Gravelle_Michael-MPP-CO" <mgravelle.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org>
Sent: Monday, July 13, 2020 10:43:32 AM
Subject: George Collins Hornepayne area water concerns

To: The Hon. Jeff Yurek Minister of Environment, Conservation and Parks
To: Office of the Environmental Commissioner of Ontario c/o Auditor General of Ontario
To: Environmental Defence Canada Kelsey Scarfone Program Manager, Water

Dear Minister Yurek, Environmental Minister of Ontario, and Kelsey Scarfone, Environmental Defence Canada:

Please find attached a letter, and background files and documents, from my constituent Mr. George Collins of Nipigon, about an unresolved ground-water contamination issue near Hornepayne.

The problem began with groundwater contamination by diesel fuel on land owned by Canadian National Rail. Mr. Collins refers to a 2002 Ground Water Study document that has gone missing, and was the subject of his FOI request and appeal to the Ontario Ombudsman. Mr. Collins is fighting the costs being imposed on the residents and municipality of Hornepayne that he feels are the responsibility of CN. A new

water source for the town was required with a $10.6 million cost for finding and accessing a distant watershed, as the municipal or 'town' wells could not escape the diesel pollution. I agree with Mr. Collins that this major cost should be borne by CNR.

Mr. Collins has been deeply engaged in this effort for decades now. Having received no action or satisfaction from the government, CNR, and the Ombudsman, we are hoping that that we may receive the attention of your offices in regaining the 'lost' ground water study, and possibly 'reverse-engineering' of the process undergone by the Town of Hornepayne, and identifying who is truly and fairly responsible for payment of the ground water study, and the cost of finding and deploying a new municipal water source.

As MPP for Thunder Bay-Superior North, I will respectfully request the attention of your respective offices to Mr. Collins' appeal, and will encourage your direct contact with him to answer questions, and identify new ways and means to correct this injustice, and accurately assess the damage and consequences as caused by CNR fuel spills.

Your specialized and expert attention to this complex case is greatly appreciated.

Sincere thanks,

Michael Gravelle MPP *Thunder Bay-Superior North*
Constituency Office 179 S. Algoma St. Thunder Bay, Ontario P7B 3C1
807 345 3647 Fax 807 345 2922
Toll Free 1-888-516-5555
mgravelle.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org

From: George J Collins <grampabug7@hotmail.com>
Sent: July 6, 2020 5:49 PM
To: Gravelle-CO, Michael <mgravelle.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org>
Subject: Letter.

Crystal Caputo,

Hello, Crystal please let me know if you receive this email. Thank you Geo.

Virus-free. www.avg.com

Received 9-17-2020

Ontario

Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks

Drinking Water and Environmental Compliance Division, Northern Region
Sudbury District, Sudbury Office
199 Larch Street
Suite 1201
Sudbury, ON P3E 5P9
Tel.: 705 564-3237
Toll Free: 1-800-890-8516
Fax: 705 564-4180

Ministère de l'Environnement, de la Protection de la nature et des Parcs

Division de la conformité en matière d'eau potable et d'environnement, Direction régionale du Nord
District de Sudbury, bureau de Sudbury
199, rue Larch
Bureau 1201
Sudbury ON P3E 5P9
Tél. : 705 564-3237
Numéro sans frais : 1-800-890-8516
Téléc. : 705 564-4180

357-2020-1

Mr. George Collins
Email: grampabug7@hotmail.com

Dear Mr. Collins:

Thank you for your email regarding groundwater concerns and the former Hornepayı well water system. Your email was forwarded to the Honourable Jeff Yurek, Minister the Environment, Conservation and Parks, and I have been asked to respond to you behalf of Minister Yurek.

In your letter, you state your concern that groundwater contamination from the Canadian National (CN) yard in Hornepayne was a factor in the decision to change t town's water supply from wells to a surface water source. The ministry is aware of historical diesel and oil contamination at the Hornepayne yard and has an oversight in CN's ongoing remediation efforts to address this contamination.

From the ministry's perspective, the 2002 assessment of the well water supply as groundwater under the influence of surface water, also referred to as GUDI, was appropriate given the proximity of the wells to a local creek and the characteristics of the aquifer. The GUDI assessment was completed as a ministry requirement for an engineering evaluation of existing treatment systems at every municipal water syster Ontario and was not undertaken specifically in response to contamination at the CN yard.

With respect to municipal water treatment, the ministry's role is to evaluate and appr the design and construction of any new facility and to ensure that the system is operated in compliance with our legislation. The decision on the preferred option for type of facility to be constructed rests with the municipality based on a several factor including the technical information provided to them by their consulting engineers. In this case the municipality made the decision to establish a surface water treatment p rather than upgrading the existing wells that were determined to be GUDI.

Regarding the 2002 report by one of the municipality's consultants that you indicate have not been able to access, I understand from our Access and Privacy Office that were provided with a number of documents in June and November of 2018. Included with those records was a report by KGS Group titled "Hydrogeological Study - Groundwater Under the Influence," dated September 2002 which I believe is the rep you are referencing. If you have questions about an additional report, please contact directly to provide more details and I would be happy to confirm if the ministry has a copy and whether it can be shared.

I trust this information is helpful. If you have more questions or concerns, you can re me directly at 705-929-7193, or toll-free at 1-800-890-8516, or by email at marnie.managhan@ontario.ca.

Best regards,

Marnie Managhan

Marnie Managhan
Water Compliance Supervisor, Sudbury District Office
Drinking Water and Environmental Compliance Division

c: Mr. Michael Gravelle, MPP, Thunder Bay—Superior North

(1)

My Copy:
Sent 0950
9.28, 2020

George Collins,
Sept 18th, 2020,
357-2020-1.

Ms. Marnie Managhan,
Water Compliance Supervisor,
Sudbury District Office,
Environmental Compliance Division.

Dear Ms. Managhan.

I thank you for your recent response on behalf of Minister Yurek, received Sept 17th, 2020 concerning environmental matters in Hornepayne Ont.

Hoping you will find it acceptable, I will respond to your email on a per paragraph basis, and then follow up with additional information which I feel will be helpful. All information comes from studies done relevant to the matter, and where I do interject with opinion, I will state the same so as not to obscure the lines between established fact and conjecture.

Concerning your reference in paragraph two (2), to your Ministries awareness of ongoing "remediation efforts to address this contamination" in Hornepayne. I point out that this is twenty five years (25) after cleanup operations began which in itself gives clear indication of the enormity of problem. Considering the same, is it not strange that after all this time neither the Municipality nor any other governmental agency has ever once issued a statement of facts concerning the extent and degree of CN's pollution to the people of Hornepayne?

I point out that CN Rail is the only party that benefits from this silence.

Response to your email.

In your paragraph three (3), I agree with your ministries perspective concerning the appropriateness of the GUDI designation of the Well Water Supply in 2002, and also your statement that it was "not specifically in response to contamination at the CN yard". Both statements are fundamentally correct as well as your reference to the Hydrogeological Study which was done by KGS and completed, Sept.2002. However the FACTS which were revealed by the First Engineers Report completed in Jan 2001, and the subsequent Hydrogeological Study by KGS that you refer to, revealed certain geological factors within the Jackfish River Basin which determined that all groundwater therein would inevitably become polluted.(Please see attached docs. marked ABC) The Township Wells were located within that Jackfish River Basin in the DIRECT PATH of CN's, MILLIONS of MIGRATING LITERS of DIESEL FUEL (and other pollutants) and by 2002 that pollution had been working its way towards those municipal wells for over fifty years.

I point out the importance of the year 2001, because at this point a major anomaly occurs, specifically when KGS enters the picture as a hired contractor for the Municipality of Hornepayne.

KGS at that time was a contractor working for CN Rail, hired to clean up and mitigated the environmental effects of their pollution, and they began in that role in the mid 90's. As such there was a stark conflict of interest when the Town hired them to do the Hydrogeological Study, and one that the MOE was aware of as a result of their interactions with KGS in those clean-up operations between the mid 90's and 2002. By the time KGS took on the Hydro-geo study for the town of Hornepayne they were aware of the extent and degree of the pollution in the

Little Jackfish River drainage basin (43,922) ha. This contract with the Township of Hornepayne came at an opportune time for them for a couple of reasons, (1) they already had most of the information on hand from their previous work in the area, and (2) it gave them a perfect opportunity to protect the interests of their primary employer CN Rail. In my opinion, KGS's relationship with CN should have been an unwavering disqualifying factor, eliminating them from doing any environmental work for the municipality, but as evidenced by the Towns decisions it was no problem to them. I believe that the Town Admin. also viewed it as a convenience which would ensure that CN, their first priority in local issues would be protected.

In your paragraph four (4) you point out that the final decision to either improve the municipal wells or go to a new surface water source, "rests with the municipality". I conclude based upon the facts revealed from the studies that the Municipal decision to make Moonlight Lake a new surface water source was in fact the correct decision under the circumstances. Further it is my opinion that there was no other reasonable alternative available to them, it was the closest source of water which was beyond and would remain beyond the infiltration of the estimated, THREE MILLION (3,000,000) liters of spilt diesel fuel on and moving in the ground from the Hornepayne CN Rail Yard.

That estimate is very conservative based upon my (60) years of living in that area, but large enough to refute any attempt by any entity from dismissing the matter as trivial.

Lest my support of the Municipality's final decision cause any confusion allow me to clarify matters by restating the facts. With the commencement of locomotive refueling in Hornepayne (1957) the pollution going into the ground was dramatically increased and that polluted ground water moved at a rate of 2 to 4 meters per annum down grade, through the Jackfish River Basin in the direction of the municipal wells . Simultaneously the Jackfish River carried millions of liters downstream directly over the aquifer which the town wells were

situated in. Consequently the surface soil on the aquifer became contaminated, and with annual rain fall, snow melts, and flooding that contamination began working its way down into the Aquifer. By the year 2000 most of the lower section and ground water in the central portion of the Jackfish River Basin was polluted, by CN's spreading pollution and it will remain so for decades if not centuries to come. STUDIES revealed these facts, and as a result of the same the pro CN Administration in Hornepayne had no other choice but to go out and beyond this polluted area for a new water source.

That CN's pollution was for decades allowed to enter the environment undeterred, constitutes my first objection, it could have been prevented if a minimum of safe guards had been incorporated into their operations from the beginning, but the fact is there were NONE. My second objection in this travesty occurs through the collusion of the entities involved, that being "fiddling the books" to place the Ten point six million dollar infrastructure cost to access a new water source, on the backs of the ratepayers of Hornepayne, knowing full well that cost belonged on the doorsteps of CN Rail, it constitutes an unconscionable act.

In your paragraph five (5) you are mistaken in your belief concerning the Hydrogeological Study and The Ground Water Study. The Hydrogeological Study was a recommendation that came out of the First Eng. Report, and the Groundwater study was a recommendation by KGS that came out of the Hydrogeological Study, for your info I attach three additional docs. (marked DEF) which will clarify the same.

As a direct result of the local Hornepayne newspapers refusal to print any of my material which was critical of CN Rail. I was obliged to construct an internet site where I could post information for interested parties to view. May I suggest you to go to [illegible] and on that site in PDF #47, titled Fair

Conclusion, Record was Expunged, and also PDF# 41, Titled Rather Unusual, you will find further documentation which shows that the Sixty (60) percent completed Ground Water Study was the topic of an exchange between one Susan Smith, the Hornepayne Town Administrator/ clerk at that time , and the MOE.

I trust this information will be helpful Ms. Managhan, and should you require more substantiating documentation I offer the following. On my site in PDF #48, Titled, Meet Dr. Earle, and PDF #46 Titled, Studies Reveal Friday 13th 2018, I'm confident you will find any answers to any questions you may have. As you will see, that site contains a lot of supporting doc., reports and studies mostly from the Township and the MOE which I obtained through the Freedom of Information Act. A word of advice, do not try to google the site or find it with a search engine it is not listed with any, you will need to type in the title in the URL at the top of your computer to accesses the site.

If I can be of further assistance please do not hesitate to get in touch. I Thank You for your time and attention to this serious concern.

CC: To Mr. Michael Gravelle, MPP, Thunder Bay-Superior North
Ms. Roussel, Canadian Environmental Law Association.

Sincerely,
George Collins.

George Collins.

b E "

Kathy Bemben

From: Sue Smith - Township of Hornepayne [townshipofhornepayne@onlink.net]
Sent: October 29, 2004 3:20 PM
To: kbemben@enl-tbay.com
Subject: Fw: Hornepayne Groundwater Study

----- Original Message -----
From: David.Neufeld@ene.gov.on.ca
To: townshipofhornepayne@onlink.net
Cc: Mark.Puumala@ene.gov.on.ca ; Dave.Hollinger@ene.gov.on.ca ; Cynthia.Carr@ene.gov.on.ca ; Brent.Taylor@ene.gov.on.ca ; Richard.Tozak@ene.gov.on.ca ; Irmi.Pawlowski@ene.gov.on.ca ; Barbara.Anderson@ene.gov.on.ca ; Brian.Nixon@ene.gov.on.ca
Sent: Friday, October 29, 2004 2:32 PM
Subject: Hornepayne Groundwater Study

Dear Sue Smith,
(Clerk, Township of Hornpayne)

In our phone discussion this morning you confirmed the information sent to us by your consultant (Kathy Engineering Northwest Ltd.), in a memo dated October 25, 2004. You indicated that the Township has d change its water supply from a groundwater source to a surface water source, and that the groundwater which you received a grant, is approximately 60%, and is now on hold. You also confirmed what is state memo about the Township's request to use the remaining funds towards a source protection plan for the source. As we discussed, this would require that the original MOE-approved terms of reference for your source protection study be updated to reflect the new source of drinking water. The updated terms of ref would need to be approved by the Ministry (regional office) before funds could be used for that purpose.

In addition, the Township is required to submit all components of the groundwater study completed to da including all data that been collected in the appropriate digital formats, as per the original terms of refere any data sharing agreements you have signed for the project. Please contact Mark Puumala, from our R MOE Office (Sudbury) for discussion of the revisions to the original terms of reference.

Dr. David Neufeld
Manager, Water Policy Branch
Ontario Ministry of the Environment
135 St. Clair Avenue, 6th floor
Toronto, Ontario M4V 1P5
(416) 314-7049

Joseph De Luca, P.Eng.
Senior Project Engineer / Infrastructure

Tel: +1 807 625 8707 Cell: +1 807 627 5207
101-973 Balmoral Street, Thunder Bay
Ontario Canada P7B 0E2

HATCH

BEST MANAGED COMPANIES Platinum member

Canada's Top 100 Employers 2017

Canada's Top Employers for Young People

From: miller.hpayne@bellnet.ca [mailto:miller.hpayne@bellnet.ca]
Sent: Wednesday, October 25, 2017 1:03 PM
To: DeLuca, Joseph <joseph.deluca@hatch.com>
Subject: Request for Information - Township of Hornepayne

Good afternoon Joseph,

Gail forwarded me your email address to follow up on a discussion that you ha this week pertaining to a request for information that we received here at the

In 2002, Engineering Northwest commissioned KGS group to conduct a Hydro Study for the Township wells; as a result of the findings, a groundwater study to be conducted. The study was extended once and then put on hold. It was c 60% complete. I have attached correspondence dating back to 2004 stating t original groundwater study was in the end discontinued in favour of a source study as the Township changed its plans to go from a well system to a surface system. The MOE had requested that the 60% of what was completed from th groundwater study be submitted to them. (please find record of this attached

I have searched our records and cannot find any data pertaining to this incom groundwater study. I have also been in touch with KGS group and they do nc record if this either.

Would you happen to have record of this data?

Any assistance you could provide would certainly be appreciated and please d hesitate to contact me should you require any further information.

Thank you very much for your time.

Shawna Miller
Bookkeeper/Cashier
Township of Hornepayne
68 Front St P.O. Box 370
Hornepayne, ON P0M 1Z0